



# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
United States Patent and Trademark Office  
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450  
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/010,968	11/13/2001	Daniel M. Elliott	2803.11US02	5705

24113 7590 10/06/2003

PATTERSON, THUENTE, SKAAR & CHRISTENSEN, P.A.  
4800 IDS CENTER  
80 SOUTH 8TH STREET  
MINNEAPOLIS, MN 55402-2100

EXAMINER

GILBERT, SAMUEL G

ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
----------	--------------

3736

DATE MAILED: 10/06/2003

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

T B

**Office Action Summary**

Application No.

10/010,968

Applicant(s)

ELLIOTT ET AL.

Examiner

Samuel G Gilbert

Art Unit

3736

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

**Period for Reply**

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133).
- Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

**Status**

- 1) ☐ Responsive to communication(s) filed on \_\_\_\_.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**.                      2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

**Disposition of Claims**

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1-74 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) \_\_\_\_ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☒ Claim(s) 11-14, 19-31, 38, 44-47, 52-55, 58, 60, 61 and 66-74 is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1-3, 15-17, 32-37, 39-43, 48, 50, 51, 56, 57, 59 and 62-65 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☒ Claim(s) 4-10, 18 and 49 is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

**Application Papers**

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☒ The drawing(s) filed on 09 September 2002 is/are: a) ☒ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.  
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
- 11) ☐ The proposed drawing correction filed on \_\_\_\_ is: a) ☐ approved b) ☐ disapproved by the Examiner.  
If approved, corrected drawings are required in reply to this Office action.
- 12) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner.

**Priority under 35 U.S.C. §§ 119 and 120**

- 13) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).  
a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some \* c) ☐ None of:  
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.  
2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_.  
3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).  
\* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.
- 14) ☒ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(e) (to a provisional application).  
a) ☐ The translation of the foreign language provisional application has been received.
- 15) ☒ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. §§ 120 and/or 121.

**Attachment(s)**

- 1) ☒ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)                      4) ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413) Paper No(s). \_\_\_\_
- 2) ☐ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)                      5) ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152)
- 3) ☒ Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449) Paper No(s) 3 and 8.                      6) ☐ Other:

Art Unit: 3736

### **DETAILED ACTION**

An application in which the benefits of an earlier application are desired must contain a specific reference to the prior application(s) in the first sentence of the specification of in an application data sheet (37 CFR 1.78(a)(2) and (a)(5)). The specific reference to any prior nonprovisional application must include the relationship (i.e., continuation, divisional, or continuation-in-part) between the applications except when the reference is to a prior application of a CPA assigned the same application number.

The status of the applications recited in the reference contained in the first sentence should be updated.

### ***Information Disclosure Statement***

The information disclosure statements filed 7/26/02 and 2/5/03 have been considered. The lined through reference has not been considered because a publication date was not provided.

### ***Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 102***

The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless –

(e) the invention was described in (1) an application for patent, published under section 122(b), by another filed in the United States before the invention by the applicant for patent or (2) a patent granted on an application for patent by another filed in the United States before the invention by the applicant for patent, except that an international application filed under the treaty defined in section 351(a) shall have the effects for purposes of this subsection of an application filed in the United States only if the international application designated the United States and was published under Article 21(2) of such treaty in the English language.

Art Unit: 3736

Claims 3, 15-17, 37, 39-43, 48, 50, 51, 56, 57, 59, and 63-65 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) as being anticipated by Kindlein et al (6,454,696).

The needles are automatically placed by the stepper unit and controlled by the ultrasound probe, applicant's attention is invited to column 4 lines 48-50. It is the examiner's position that the X-Y movements are inherently controlled by the unit because the needles are enclosed in housing -8-. The applicant's attention is also invited to column 1 lines 47-64 and column 6 lines 55-67.

***Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103***

The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negated by the manner in which the invention was made.

Claims 1 and 2 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Kindlein et al (6,454,696).

Kindlein et al teaches a device as claimed but does not include a seed cartridge. The examiner is taking official notice that the use of seed cartridges are old and well known in the medical arts. It would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time the invention was made to use seed cartridges with the device of Kindlein et

Art Unit: 3736

al. Further the use of seed cartridges would provide the additional advantage of reducing the time required to perform the surgical procedure thereby reducing the risk to the patient.

Claims 32-36 and 62 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Kindlein et al(6,454,696) in view of Ford (6,572,526).

Kindlein et al teaches a device as claimed but does not include a sensor for motion control. Ford teaches a sensor for controlling needles for brachytherapy. It would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time the invention was made to include the sensors of Ford in the device of Kindlein et al to provide the device with additional automatic guidance for inserting needles as taught by Ford.

***Allowable Subject Matter***

Claims 4-10, 18, and 49 are objected to as being dependent upon a rejected base claim, but would be allowable if rewritten in independent form including all of the limitations of the base claim and any intervening claims.

Claims 11-14, 19-31, 38, 44-47, 52-55, 58, 60, 61, and 66-74 are allowed.

Art Unit: 3736

***Conclusion***

The prior art made of record and not relied upon is considered pertinent to applicant's disclosure. US Patents 6,554,759; 6,270,472; 6,200,255 teach related needle implantation devices.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Samuel G Gilbert whose telephone number is 703-308-3553. The examiner can normally be reached M-F 5:30-2:00.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Max Hindenburg can be reached on 703-308-3130. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is (703) 872-9306.

Any inquiry of a general nature or relating to the status of this application or proceeding should be directed to the receptionist whose telephone number is 703-308-0858.



Samuel G Gilbert  
Primary Examiner  
Art Unit 3736

sgg